

Committee Report

Item No: 3

Reference: DC/18/00717 & DC/18/00718

Case Officer: Samantha Summers

Ward: Sudbury South.

Ward Member/s: Cllr Simon Barrett. Cllr Luke Cresswell.

RECOMMENDATION – GRANT PLANNING PERMISSION, GRANT LISTED BUILDING CONSENT

Description of Development

DC/18/00717 - Planning Application - Erection of new gallery building (following demolition of the Labour Exchange); Rearrangement and extension of the Weavers Lane cottages and print workshop. Alterations to improve accessibility within Gainsborough House and improved accessibility into the site.

DC/18/00718 - Erection of new gallery building (following demolition of the Labour Exchange); Rearrangement and extension of the Weavers Lane cottages and print workshop. Alterations to improve accessibility within Gainsborough House and improved accessibility into the site.

Location

Gainsborough House, 46 Gainsborough Street, Sudbury, Suffolk CO10 2EU

Parish: Sudbury

Site Area: 1410 m²

Conservation Area: Sudbury

Listed Building: Affects Setting of Grade I

Received: 16/02/2018

Expiry Date: 16/04/2018

Application Type: FUL - Full Planning Application

Development Type: Minor

Applicant: Gainsborough's House

Agent: Mr Angus Goodwin

PART ONE – REASON FOR REFERENCE TO COMMITTEE

The application is referred to committee for the following reason:

The Corporate Manager – Growth and Sustainable Planning considers the application to be of a controversial nature.

PART TWO – APPLICATION BACKGROUND

History

The planning history relevant to the application site is listed below. A detailed assessment of the planning history including any material Planning Appeals will be carried out as needed in Part Three:

DC/17/05838	Application for Listed Building Consent- Repairs to floor joists/fixings to first and second floors; Inspection and removal of external render and make repairs/damp proof where necessary and re-paint.	Granted 02/02/2018
B/07/00808	Application for Listed Building Consent - Retention of roller shutter to rear door.	Granted 20/08/2007
B/06/01269	Application for Listed Building Consent - Erection of glazed canopy (as amended by certificate dated 25/08/06 and drawing dated 18/09/06).	Granted 20/09/2006
B/06/01268	Erection of glazed canopy (as amended by certificate dated 25/08/06 and drawing dated 18/09/06).	Granted 20/09/2006
B/04/02128	Application for Advertisement Consent - Erection of "Gainsborough House" sign and hanging sign to 1-2 Weavers Lane.	Granted 24/01/2005
B/04/00440	Erection of glazed canopy.	Withdrawn 08/06/2006
B/04/00439	Application for Listed Building Consent - Alterations to brick work on front elevation; insertion of 1 no. door on rear elevation; internal alterations (as amended by details dated 26/06/04).	Granted 12/08/2004
B/97/00508	APPLICATION FOR LISTED BUILDING CONSENT - REMOVAL OF MEMORIAL PLAQUE AND REPOSITIONING OF PLAQUE ON EAST SIDE OF WEST GARDEN WALL	Granted 18/09/1997
B/97/00164	GRANT APPLICATION - HISTORIC BUILDING GRANT BALLINGDON STREET TO GAINSBOROUGH STREET	
B/91/01208	INSERTION OF DORMER WINDOW	Granted 20/11/1991
B/91/01169	APPLICATION FOR LISTED BUILDING CONSENT - INSERTION OF DORMER WINDOW AND INTERNAL ALTERATIONS	Granted 04/12/1991
B/91/00161	APPLICATION FOR LISTED BUILDING CONSENT - ERECTION OF SLATE PLAQUE ON FRONT ELEVATION	Granted 13/03/1991

B/89/00881	APPLICATION FOR LISTED BUILDING CONSENT - INTERNAL ALTERATIONS TO TOILET ACCOMMODATION	Granted 27/11/1989
B/86/80192	APPLICATION FOR LISTED BUILDING CONSENT - 2 FLAGPOLES CANTILEVERED OUT FROM WALL AND 2 NON-ILLUMINATED INFORMATION BOARDS (AS AMENDED BY DRAWING RECEIVED ON 07/05/87)	Granted 01/06/1987
B/86/70043	APPLICATION FOR ADVERTISEMENT CONSENT - 2 NON-ILLUMINATED INFORMATION PANELS (AS AMENDED BY DRAWING RECEIVED ON 07/05/87)	Granted 07/05/1987
B/86/70042	APPLICATION FOR ADVERTISEMENT CONSENT - 2 FLAGPOLES CANTILEVERED OUT FROM WALL (AS AMENDED BY DRAWING RECEIVED ON 07/05/87)	Granted 08/05/1987

All Policies Identified As Relevant

The proposal has been assessed with regard to adopted development plan policies, the National Planning Policy Framework and all other material considerations. Highlighted local and national policies are listed below. Detailed assessment of policies in relation to the recommendation and issues highlighted in this case will be carried out within the assessment:

Summary of Policies

The following development plan policies are of particular relevance in the determination of this application:

CN01 - Design Standards
 CN06 - Listed Buildings - Alteration/Ext/COU
 CN08 - Development in/near conservation areas
 TP15 - Parking Standards - New Development
 CS01 - Applying the presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development in Babergh
 CS03 - Strategy for Growth and Development
 CS15 - Implementing Sustainable Development in Babergh
 CS16 - Town, Village and Local Centres

Details of Previous Committee / Resolutions and any member site visit

Member undertook an inspection of the site and its surroundings on the 28th March 2018.

Details of any Pre-Application Advice

Extensive pre-application advice has taken place with the Museum undertaking comprehensive public engagement, with plans being on display within the museum for some months. Engagement with all Ward Members for Sudbury and the Sudbury Town Council has also taken place. Advice from Historic England, the Heritage Team and your Development Management Officer have been given during the course of pre-application. Changes to the design and height of the extension have been made following this advice.

Consultations and Representations

During the course of the application Consultation and Representations from third parties have been received. These are summarised below. All comments received have been taken into account when reaching the conclusion and recommendation set out within this report.

A: Summary of Consultations

Sudbury Town Council

Recommend - approval - however need to ensure a site construction management plan is agreed which takes into account local residents access needs. Also identify any need for mitigation of vibration from piling. Concerns from the Sudbury Society regarding the lack of evidence from an accessibility consultant were also noted.

Heritage Team

The Heritage Team does not object to the proposed development as it will cause no harm to the significance of the listed building, and it will enhance the character and appearance of this part of the Conservation Area. Conditions required to secure detailing.

Historic England

Historic England has no objection to the application on heritage grounds. We consider that the application meets the requirements of the NPPF, in particular paragraph numbers 6, 7 and 14. If the Council is minded to grant consent we would recommend conditions are applied to agree materials and detailing for the exterior of the new gallery building, extension to the existing shop, the new covered walkway and the rear doors to the listed house. In determining this application you should bear in mind the statutory duty of section 66(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 to have special regard to the desirability of preserving listed buildings or their setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which they possess and section 72(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 to pay special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of conservation areas.

Natural England

No comments to make on this application. Standing advice should be followed.

Suffolk Preservation Society

Thank you for consulting the SPS on this culturally important and ambitious scheme. Having reviewed the proposals the Society recognises the economic benefits for Sudbury in delivering an internationally significant home for the Gainsborough art collection. Furthermore, the scheme will provide an enhanced visitor experience commensurate with the importance of the collection, which is an important cultural resource, locally, nationally and beyond. The SPS welcomes the investment in the Gainsborough Museum that will ultimately benefit the historic and architecturally rich town of Sudbury.

SCC - Fire & Rescue

No objection.

SCC - Archaeological Service

No objection. Conditions required to secure a Written Scheme of Investigation.

B: Representations

No local or third party representations have been received for this scheme at the time of writing the report. An update will be given during the Committee Meeting of any representations received following the report being written.

PART THREE – ASSESSMENT OF APPLICATION

From an assessment of relevant planning policy and guidance, representations received, the planning designations and other material issues the main planning considerations considered relevant to this case are set out including the reason/s for the decision, any alternative options considered and rejected.

1. The Site and Surroundings

- 1.1. Gainsborough's House is a Grade I Listed Building within the Conservation Area of Sudbury. It is a handsome building of red brick fronting Gainsborough Street. The house was the home of the internationally renowned painter, Thomas Gainsborough. The building was made into a museum of his life and artwork and opened to the public in 1961. Since that time the museum has increased in popularity and has added a print workshop and shop to the museum. The main entrance to the site is through Weavers Lane which is accessed from Gainsborough Street. The museum also includes a courtyard garden.
- 1.2. The application site also includes the formal Labour Exchange building to the north of the shop and print workshop. The building has not been in use for some time. There is a small car parking area between the Labour Exchange and the print workshop. Three garages are attached to the northern elevation of the Labour Exchange. Babergh District Council agreed to purchase the building for the museum, in order to demolish it and building an extension to the museum. Babergh Members have agreed to gift the building to the museum as part of this proposal.
- 1.3. Vanners Silk Mill sits directly to the north of the site and has also gifted a small corner of their land to enable the site to be developed. Vanners is a very industrial collection of buildings with a distinctive roofline.
- 1.4. To the east of the site are a row of modern three storey townhouses.

2. The Proposal

- 2.1. The proposal includes the demolition of the Labour Exchange building and three garages and erection of a three storey gallery building. Some alterations to the print workshop will be required to enable the works. An extension to the existing shop would provide a small café within the courtyard garden. A covered walkway linking the new entrance within the gallery building to the museum within the Grade I listed house is also included in this application. The existing northern wall of the garden will be replaced with a traditional crinkle-crankle wall. Alterations to make the museum house more accessible to disabled visitors are proposed.
 - 2.2. The floorspace provided will be 452 square metres.
 - 2.3. No parking is included with this proposal. The Labour Exchange has three garages and a small car parking area associated with it. However, the museum itself does not have car parking available for visitors or staff. The proposed gallery building would use all of the space located by the garages and car parking area.
 - 2.4. The gallery building will be three storeys. Weavers Lane has a gentle slope upwards from south to north. The highest point of the gallery will be on the lowest point of the site with the gallery becoming single storey at the highest point. At no point will the gallery have a height greater to that of the town houses directly opposite the site.
-

- 2.5. The gallery has been designed in a very contemporary style so that it is a good foil to the original Grade I house. Although the design is contemporary the use of materials will reflect those used in Sudbury such as Bulmer brick and flint work. The roofline is an interesting feature of the building and breaks up the expanse of roof by the introduction of ridges, similar to the industrial Vanner's building to the north. It is proposed to use a metal standing seamed roof covering.
- 2.6. The total site area is 1410 square metres.

3. National Planning Policy Framework

- 3.1. The National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) contains the Government's planning policies for England and sets out how these are expected to be applied. Planning law continues to require that applications for planning permission are determined in accordance with the Development Plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise. The policies contained within the NPPF are a material consideration and should be taken into account for decision-making purposes.

4. The Principle of Development

- 4.1. The National Planning Policy Framework considers that there are three dimensions to sustainable development – economic, social and environmental. The proposal addresses all of these issues as it will provide jobs, during construction but also the employment opportunities will be created. The proposal will increase the capability of the museum to hold events and special viewings in addition to borrowing art collections from around the world to be displayed within the purpose built gallery. This will raise the profile of the museum, Sudbury and the Babergh district as a whole. It is anticipated that the museum will benefit the town of Sudbury by the increase in spending at local shops, restaurants, cafes and public houses from tourists visiting the museum. The proposed contemporary gallery building is considered to add interest to the streetscene and replaces a building that is in poor condition and unused. This is all in-line with the NPPF.
- 4.2. The Core Strategy encourages economic growth through tourism and this is consistent with the NPPF. Gainsborough is a big tourist draw to the area and the further expansion of the museum will help support this important tourist attraction and increase footfall.
- 4.3. The Local Plan policies specifically look at the design and impact aspects of the proposal. The main issues to be addressed are the impact on the Heritage Assets, both the Listed Buildings but also the larger Conservation Area and also the impact on the neighbouring residential properties in Weavers Lane.

5. Sustainability Assessment of Proposal

- 5.1. Economic role – the proposal is considered to give potential to economic growth through both the jobs provided at construction phase but then the creation of 8 full time and 16 part time employees. The proposal will also continue to protect the existing 6 full time and 11 part time employees. The museum will also draw visitors to the town and it is anticipated that other establishments in the area will benefit from extra footfall as people explore the town and the association with the painter.
- 5.2. Social role – it is understood that the museum has many volunteers and residents that are actively involved in the museum. The proposed gallery will give more opportunity for local residents to become involved in the museum and the events that are held at the premises, including school visits. The proposals also include improvements to the Grade I listed house for people with disabilities.
-

- 5.3. Environmental role – the proposed gallery will be very different to the existing because of its contemporary design. However, it could be argued that because it is so contemporary it does not compete with the Grade I and Grade II Listed buildings in the area. The building picks up on local design features such as the ridged roof which reflects the roof of the silk mill and the walls will use locally distinctive materials of local brick and flint, as seen widely in Sudbury.
- 5.4. Eco features of the build are locally sourced materials, high levels of insulation, high thermal mass, natural daylight from north facing rooflights, LED lighting, natural ventilation to the landscape studio and optimised mechanical plant.

6. Site Access, Parking and Highway Safety Considerations

- 6.1. The museum does not have any parking on site. A small car parking area and three garages associated with the Labour Exchange building will be no longer available as the gallery building footprint is over this whole site. A Transport Assessment was submitted with the application which addresses this issue. SCC Highways have responded to the consultation and specified that three disabled parking bays and secure bicycle storage should be provided as a minimum for the scheme. The museum does not own any further land on which these could be provided. The Transport Assessment confirms that there is disabled parking available on Gainsborough Street, close to the museum. There are several car parks available in the town centre with a total of 1101 spaces available for parking. It is anticipated that many visitors will use public transport with travel by train or bus. Larger groups will be arriving by coach at a drop off point.
- 6.2. The museum is in a town centre location and therefore use of public car parks and on-street parking, with provision for disabled parking is considered to be an acceptable solution, notwithstanding the comments of the LHA. Officers do not therefore consider the application to be unacceptable in this regard.

7.7. Design and Layout [Impact on Street Scene]

- 7.1. The most significant part of this proposal is the demolition of the existing Labour Exchange building and garaging. This is a front facing building to Weavers Lane. The proposed gallery will be a contemporary three storey building at the southern end and reducing to single storey at the northern end. The roof structure is broken up with four ridges of differing height. This breaks up a very large roof and adds interest that reflects the roof of the silk mill to the north of the site. The ridges are carried down to the eastern wall on Weavers Lane. The wall is a large expanse of brick and flint work. The folds in the wall give an interesting dimension that will catch the light and soften the hard frontage. The building will be cantilevered at first floor level over the footpath to gain a little extra floor space to the first and second floors. Although the building is three storeys it does not appear to be overbearing because of the design features included to the walls and roof. It is considered to reflect local distinctiveness in a contemporary manner but uses architectural language to express itself. The town houses to the east are also modern and therefore the gallery is an acceptable addition to the streetscene. As you move from Gainsborough Street into Weavers Lane you leave the historic core of Sudbury and move towards the modern and then to the industrial area of Vanners silk mill. The Labour Exchange does not have any architectural merit and therefore the loss of the building within the Conservation Area is not considered to cause harm to the heritage asset.
- 7.2. The internal space of the gallery will include the Gainsborough Gallery, Reception, lift, WC and temporary gallery (for displaying borrowed art collections). At first floor level a community gallery (for displaying works by local artists) and office. At second floor level the plant room, kitchen and landscape studio (this will enable visitors to see the landscape that Gainsborough painted).
-

- 7.3. The scheme includes a canopy that will give a covered walkway from the new gallery to the museum house within the courtyard garden along the rear elevations of the print workshop and weavers cottages.
- 7.4. A small café is proposed to the rear of the existing shop. This will be a lightweight glass structure of single storey giving views of the courtyard garden. The shop will remain in the same location as existing and will form the exit point to visitors when they have finished their visit.
- 7.5. The north west corner of the print workshop will be lost to enable access from the new gallery building to other areas of the museum. Vanners have gifted a small corner of land to the south eastern corner of their site.
- 7.6. The existing northern brick wall of the courtyard will be replaced by a traditional crinkle-crackle wall that is more interesting and in-keeping with the historic nature of the house and garden. It also breaks up the rather dominant brick wall of the Vanners Mill building.
- 7.7. The widening of an existing opening in the rear wall of the house will enable a level access to be installed so that disabled visitor can easily access the historic house. Once inside the house there is an existing left which reaches the upper floors.
- 7.8. In light of the above, officers consider that the scheme is acceptable in respect of its design and impacts upon the street scene and character/appearance of the area.

8. Environmental Impacts - Trees, Ecology and Land Contamination

- 8.1. These matters have been considered by officers, however do not raise any issues of significance.

9. Heritage Issues [Including The Impact On The Character And Appearance Of The Conservation Area And On The Setting Of Neighbouring Listed Buildings]

- 9.1. This application concerns the construction of a gallery in place of the former labour exchange on Weavers Lane, an unlisted building from the interwar period, which is arranged parallel to the road. There are also some changes proposed to the cottages on Weavers Lane and the adjacent print workshop, along with improved accessibility into the site and along the courtyard garden and repairs to parts of Gainsborough House itself.
 - 9.2. The issues of heritage concern relate to the impact of the demolition and reconstruction on the character and appearance of the Conservation Area, as well as on the setting of Gainsborough House, a Grade I listed property which backs onto the labour exchange.
 - 9.3. In order to construct the gallery, the labour exchange must be demolished. This is acceptable. The building is unsightly and does not contribute in a positive manner to the character or appearance of the area.
 - 9.4. The proposed gallery reflects the massing, form and materials palette discussed at pre-application stage. Its mass is undeniably large, but given its context, in proximity to buildings of a similar overall height and scale, and the meaning that it conveys as a national centre for exhibiting Gainsborough's art, it is considered acceptable.
 - 9.5. The proposed changes to the cottages on Weavers Lane are acceptable, as are the changes to the accessibility of the site and garden.
 - 9.6. The repairs to Gainsborough House are acceptable and require no conditions.
-

- 9.7. The proposed crinkle crankle northern boundary wall is a part of the vernacular building tradition of the area and as such will amplify local distinctiveness.
- 9.8. In summary, the work is as discussed and is considered to sustain and enhance the significance of the listed building, and the character and appearance of this part of the Conservation Area.
- 9.9. In terms of the LBA, the scheme would preserve the building and its setting and ensure the character and appearance of this part of the Conservation Area is maintained and enhanced. As far as the NPPF is concerned, there would be no harm to the significance of the building or the CA – and it is for these reasons the Heritage Team does not object to the proposed development, subject to condition.
- 9.10. Gainsborough's House is a Grade I listed building and therefore Historic England are statutory consultees. They were involved at pre-application stage and have raised no objection to the proposal. Suffolk Preservation society have also raised no objection and see the benefits that this proposal raises in terms of protection of the heritage asset and also raising awareness of the Gainsborough and his home and landscapes.

10. Impact on Residential Amenity

- 10.1. There is no doubt that the scheme will impact the neighbours directly opposite the Labour Exchange. The existing gap which is used for parking car will be replaced with a three storey building. The height of the proposed building does not exceed that of the town houses. Three windows above ground floor level are proposed to the front elevation. This is not considered to cause any further overlooking than existing from the Labour Exchange building. A loss of light is not considered to be harmful from the building as the Vanners building is directly behind the proposed gallery and light is anticipated to remain the same as existing. The outlook is not considered to be overbearing because of the design features incorporated into the building such as the folds and ridges which break up an otherwise large expanse of brickwork and roof.

11. Biodiversity And Protected Species

- 11.1. A bat survey accompanied the application. The findings of the survey confirmed that there were no bats on the site, but bats were recorded in the vicinity foraging. Enhancements to the garden by the introduction of invertebrate attracting plants is recommended under condition.

PART FOUR – CONCLUSION

12. Statement Required by Article 35 Of the Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) Order 2015.

- 12.1. When determining planning applications, The Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (England) Order 2015 requires Local Planning Authorities to explain how, in dealing with the application they have worked with the applicant to resolve any problems or issues arising.
- 12.2. In this case at pre-application stage and after considerable public engagement the height of the gallery building has been reduced.
-

13. Planning Balance

- 13.1. The application is consistent with the Development Plan in terms of design and impact on residential amenity and Heritage Assets and are also consistent with the sustainability values within the Core Strategy.
- 13.2. The application is considered to address all three dimensions of sustainable development, economic role, social role, environmental role, as set out in the NPPF. Although the gallery building is a large contemporary building within a Conservation Area, it adds interest in the street scene and does not compete or pretend to be a historic building. It is bold but uses locally distinctive materials and also design features.
- 13.3. This addition to the museum is a nationally important scheme where the biggest collection of one Britain's most celebrated painters can be displayed and where other internal art collections can be displayed in a secure building. The scheme is the receiver of large grant from the Heritage Lottery totalling in millions of pounds with the total spend estimated at £8.5 million.
- 13.4. The museum will encourage visitors to Sudbury and the surrounding area, adding further economic benefits to the town.

RECOMMENDATION A

Grant planning permission subject to the following conditions:

- Standard Time Limit
- Approved Plans and Documents
- Agreement of Materials
- Construction Management Plan
- Standard Archaeological Conditions
- Sample of brick and flint panel
- Detailed window drawings
- Details of eaves and verges
- Details of rooflights
- Details of rainwater goods
- Elevations and roof plan illustrating the proposed location of all HVAC units and ductwork
- Ecology Enhancements

RECOMMENDATION B

Grant Listed Building Consent subject to the following conditions:

- Standard Time Limit
 - Approved Plans and Documents
 - Agreement of Materials
 - Sample of brick and flint panel
 - Detailed window drawings
 - Details of eaves and verges
 - Details of rooflights
 - Details of rainwater goods
 - Elevations and roof plan illustrating the proposed location of all HVAC units and ductwork
-